

**Court of Appeals, Division One**  
**Civil Appeal**

**1 CA-CV 15-0743**

**BIGGS et al. v. BETLACH et al.**

**Appellate Case Information**

Case Filed: 10-Nov-2015  
Case Closed:

**Dept/Composition**

**Court of Appeals, Division One**  
**Civil Appeal**

**1 CA-CV 15-0743**

**BIGGS et al. v. BETLACH et al.**

**Side 1. ANDY BIGGS, et al., Plaintiff/Appellant**  
**(Litigant Group) ANDY BIGGS et al.**

- Andy Biggs
- Andrew Tobin
- Nancy Barto
- Judy Burges
- Chester Crandell
- Gail Griffin
- Al Melvin
- Kelli Ward
- Steve Yarbrough
- Kimberly Yee
- John Allen
- Brenda Barton
- Sonny Borrelli
- Paul Boyer
- Karen Fann
- Eddie Farnsworth
- Thomas Forese
- David Gowan
- Rick Gray
- John Kavanagh
- Adam Kwasman
- Debbie Lesko
- David Livingston
- Phil Lovas
- J D Mesnard
- Darin Mitchell
- Steve Montenegro
- Justin Olson
- Warren Petersen
- Justin Pierce
- Carl Seel
- Steve Smith
- David Stevens
- Bob Thorpe
- Kelly Townsend
- Michelle Ugenti
- Jeanette Dubreil
- Katie Miller
- Tom Jenney

**Attorneys for: Plaintiffs/Appellants**  
Christina Sandefur, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 27983)  
Aditya Dynar, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 31583)

**Court of Appeals, Division One**  
**Civil Appeal**

**1 CA-CV 15-0743**

**BIGGS et al. v. BETLACH et al.**

**Side 2. THOMAS J. BETLACH, Defendant/Appellee**  
(Litigant Group) THOMAS J BETLACH

- Thomas J Betlach

**Attorneys for: Defendant/Appellee Betlach**  
Douglas C Northup, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 13987)  
Timothy J Berg, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 4170)  
Patrick Irvine, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 6534)  
Carrie Pixler Ryerson, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 28072)

**Side 3. EDMUNDO MACIAS; GARY GORHAM; DANIEL MCCORMICK; and TIM FERRELL,**  
**Intervenor-Defendants/Appellees, Intervenor Defendant**  
(Litigant Group) EDMUNDO MACIAS et al.

- Gary Gorham, Appellee
- Daniel McCormick, Appellee
- Tim Ferrell, Appellee
- Edmundo Macias, Appellee

**Co-Counsel: Intervenor Defendants/Appellees**  
Timothy M Hogan, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 4567)  
Joy Herr-Cardillo, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 9718)  
Ellen S Katz, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 12214)

**Side 4. HEALTH SYSTEM ALLIANCE OF ARIZONA, Amicus Curiae**  
(Litigant Group) HEALTH SYSTEM ALLIANCE OF ARIZONA

- Health System Alliance of Arizona

**Attorneys for: Amicus Curiae HSAA**  
Kory A Langhofer, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 24722)

**Side 5. ARIZONA HOSPITAL AND HEALTHCARE ASSOCIATION, Amicus Curiae**  
(Litigant Group) ARIZONA HOSPITAL AND HEALTHCARE ASSOCIATION

- Arizona Hospital and Healthcare Association

**Co-Counsel for: Amicus Curiae AzHHA**  
Roopali H Desai, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 24295)  
D Andrew Gaona, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 28414)  
Ann-Marie Alameddin, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 23570)

**CASE STATUS**

Mar 31, 2016....At Issue

PREDECESSOR CASE(S)	Cause/Charge/Class	Judgment/Sentence	Judge, Role <Comments>	Trial	Dispo
MAR CV2013-011699	Injunctive and Declaratory Relief		Douglas Gerlach, Authoring Judge of Order		

**23 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

1.	10-Nov-2015	FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appeal from Maricopa County Superior Court filed 10/13/15
2.	10-Nov-2015	FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries
3.	18-Nov-2015	FILED: Notice to Parties re: Appellant's Case Management Statement/Brief Due; Intervenor/Appellees' Fee Due
4.	23-Nov-2015	FILED: Reporter's Transcript – 07/30/2015 - (Nicole Sesta); Certificate of Service of Transcript (Appellant)
5.	1-Dec-2015	FILED: Letter, 12/1/15, to Court from Counsel for Intervenor-Defendants/Appellees' Macias, Gorham, McCormick and Ferrell re: submission of filing fee
6.	4-Dec-2015	RECEIPT No.: 2015-01675 ; \$140.00, Authorization: #37012071743, Applied to: EDMUNDO MACIAS et al. - Class B Filing Fee (\$140.00) Paid for: William E Morris Institute for Justice - By Integrated Resource Systems IN
7.	8-Dec-2015	FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellant)
8.	4-Jan-2016	FILED: Notice of Appearance; Certificate of Service of Notice of Appearance (Appellant)
9.	8-Jan-2016	FILED: Notice of Withdrawal of Counsel; Certificate of Service of Notice of Withdrawal of Counsel (Appellant)
10.	19-Jan-2016	FILED: Plaintiffs/Appellants' Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance of Plaintiffs/Appellants' Opening Brief; Certificate of Service of Plaintiffs/Appellants' Opening Brief
11.	7-Mar-2016	FILED: Answering Brief; Certificate of Compliance for Answering Brief; Certificate of Service for Answering Brief (Appellee Betlach)

**Court of Appeals, Division One**  
**Civil Appeal**

**1 CA-CV 15-0743**

**BIGGS et al. v. BETLACH et al.**

**23 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

12. 7-Mar-2016 FILED: Intervenor-Defendants/Appellees' Answering Brief; Certificate of Compliance for Intervenor-Defendants/Appellees' Answering Brief; Certificate of Service for Intervenor-Defendants/Appellees' Answering Brief
13. 10-Mar-2016 RECEIPT No.: 2016-00316 ; \$140.00, Authorization: #69015804365, Applied to: EDMUNDO MACIAS et al. - Overpayment Class B (\$140.00) Paid for: Arizona Center for Law in the Public Interest - By Integrated Resources Systems IN (Memo: Duplicate Pmt - See Rcpt 2015-01675)
14. 31-Mar-2016 FILED: Plaintiffs/Appellants' Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance of Plaintiffs/Appellants' Reply Brief; Certificate of Service of Plaintiffs/Appellants' Reply Brief (Appellant)
15. 6-Apr-2016 FILED: Defendant/Appellee's Request for Oral Argument (Thomas Betlach); Certificate of Service for Request for Oral argument (Appellee)
16. 6-Apr-2016 FILED: Appellants' Request for Oral Argument; Certificate of Service of Appellants' Request for Oral Argument (Appellant)
17. 20-Apr-2016 FILED: Letter, 4/20/16, from COA1 to Timothy M Hogan re: refund of monies submitted in error
18. 22-Apr-2016 FILED: Brief of Amicus Curiae Arizona Hospital and Healthcare Association in Support of Appellees - Filed with the Written Consent of All Parties; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service; Notice of Filing of Written Consents
19. 25-Apr-2016 FILED: Brief of Amicus Curiae Health System Alliance of Arizona; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service
20. 3-May-2016 FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days
21. 11-May-2016 ORDERED: Defendant/Appellee's Request for Oral Argument (Thomas Betlach) and Appellants' Request for Oral Argument (Appellant) = GRANTED. Hon Michael J Brown - Author
22. 12-May-2016 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record
23. 16-May-2016 FILED: Appellants' Combined Response to Amicus Briefs of Arizona Hospital and Healthcare Association and Health System Alliance of Arizona; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)