Court of Appeals, Division One

Tax Appeal

1 CA-TX 16-0007 SABAN, et al. v. ADOR, et al.

Appellate Case Information

Case Filed: 3-Aug-2016

Case Closed:

Dept/Composition

Side 1. SABAN RENT-A CAR LLC, et al., Plaintiff/Appellee-Cross Appellant

(Litigant Group) SABAN RENT-A CAR LLC, et al.

- **Saban Rent-A Car LLC**
- **DS Rentco Inc**
- **PTNK**

Co-Counsel for: Plaintiffs/Appellees/X- Appellants

Taylor C Young, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 20743)

Shawn K Aiken, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 9002)

Gregory D Hanley, Esq. (MI Bar No. GregoryDHanley)

Side 2. ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE, Defendant/Appellant-Cross Appellee

(Litigant Group) ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE

- **Arizona Department of Revenue, Defendant/Appellant, Appellee, Cross-Appellee**

Co-Counsel for: Defendnt/Apellant/Apllee/X-Apellee

Kimberly J Cygan, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 13977)

Jerry A Fries, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 11788)

Thomas L Hudson, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 14485)

Eric M Fraser, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 27241)

Side 3. TOURISM AND SPORTS AUTHORITY, Defendant/Appellant-Cross Appellee

(Litigant Group) TOURISM AND SPORTS AUTHORITY

- **Tourism and Sports Authority, Defendant/Appellant, Appellee, Cross-Appellee**
- **The Arizona Sports and Tourism Authority**

Co-Counsel for: Defendnt/Appellnt/Apellee/XApellee

Timothy J Berg, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 4170)

Kevin Green, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 25506)

Gary L Birnbaum, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 4386)

Scot L Claus, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 14999)

Vail Cloar, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 32011)

PREDECESSOR CASE(S)		Cause/Charge/Class	Judgment/Sentence	Judge, Role <Comments>	Trial	Dispo
MAR	TX2010-001089	Injunctive Relief/Refund of Taxes		Christopher T Whitten, Authoring Judge of Order		

2 OPEN DUE DATES

Opening Brief due **Due By:** Thursday, February 16, 2017

ADOR [3 extensions]

Re: FILED: Notice to Counsel re: Appellant/Appellee/Cross-Appellee, Tourism and Sports Authority's, Fee Due; Appellant/Appellee/Cross-Appellee, ADOR, No Fee Due/Case Management Statement/Brief due

Opening Brief due **Due By:** Thursday, February 16, 2017

Tourism [3 extensions]

Re: FILED: Notice to Counsel re: Appellant/Appellee/Cross-Appellee, Tourism and Sports Authority's, Fee Due; Appellant/Appellee/Cross-Appellee, ADOR, No Fee Due/Case Management Statement/Brief due

43 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

1.	3-Aug-2016	FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appeal Filed from Maricopa County Superior Court Filed 07/05/16; Cross-Appeal filed 7/20/16
2.	3-Aug-2016	FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries Exhibits: None
3.	4-Aug-2016	FILED: Notice to Counsel re: Appellant/Appellee/Cross-Appellee, Tourism and Sports Authority's, Fee Due; Appellant/Appellee/Cross-Appellee, ADOR, No Fee Due/Case Management Statement/Brief due
4.	11-Aug-2016	FILED: Notice of Payment of Filing Fee; Certificate of Service to Notice of Payment of Filing Fee (Appellant Tourism)
5.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Notice of Filing Transcripts; Certificate of Service to Notice of Filing Transcripts (Appellant)
6.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 06/07/2011 - Oral Argument (Jovanna Roman for Brenda Brown) (Appellant)

Information presented in this document may not reflect all case activity and is subject to change without notice.

43 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

7.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 10/27/2011 - Oral Argument (J. Marie Moran) (Appellant)
8.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 01/23/2012 - Status Confernece (Sheri Monroe) (Appellant)
9.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 01/30/2012 - Telephonic/Electronic Status Confernece (Fiona Coxon) (Appellant)
10.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 04/15/2013 - Oral Argument (Ann Brodsky) (Appellant)
11.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 05/07/2014 - Oral Argument (Dawn Carrero) (Appellant)
12.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 07/11/2014 - Telephonic Status Conference (Ann Brodsky) (Appellant)
13.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 07/24/2015 - Motion Hearings (Dianna Aldom) (Appellant)
14.	15-Aug-2016	FILED: Reporter's Transcript - 01/15/2016 - Motion Hearing (Jean A Kappedal) (Appellant)
15.	16-Aug-2016	RECEIPT No.: 2016-01017 ; $280.00, Authorization: #28023545869, Applied to: TOURISM AND SPORTS AUTHORITY - Class A Filing Fee ($280.00) Paid for: Fennemore Craig PC - By Integrated Resources System IN
16.	24-Aug-2016	FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellant/Cross-Appellee ADOR)
17.	24-Aug-2016	FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellant/Cross-Appellee, Tourism)
18.	25-Aug-2016	FILED: Notice of Filing Transcripts; Certificate of Service (Appellant/Cross-Appellee/ADOR)
19.	25-Aug-2016	FILED: June 7, 2011 Reporter's Transcript of Proceedings (Brenda J. Brown) (Appellant/Cross-Appellee ADOR)
20.	25-Aug-2016	FILED: July 24, 2015 Reporter's Transcript of Proceedings (Renae E. Lopez) (Appellant/Cross-Appellee ADOR)
21.	16-Sep-2016	FILED: Notice of Errata; Certificate of Service to Notice of Errata (Appellant)
22.	23-Sep-2016	FILED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order to Stay Briefing; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
23.	26-Sep-2016	ORDERED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order to Stay Briefing (Appellant) = DENIED. FURTHER ORDERED: Extending time for filing opening briefs to/including 11/2/16. FURTHER ORDERED: Upon receipt of any motion that may affect content or order of briefs, court may vacate due date for opening briefs pending resolution of such motion. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
24.	29-Sep-2016	FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellees/Cross-Appellants)
25.	4-Oct-2016	RECEIPT No.: 2016-01216 ; $280.00, Authorization: Ref1: 77024587341, Applied to: SABAN RENT-A CAR LLC, et al. - Class A Filing Fee ($280.00) Paid for: Mandel Young PLC - By Integrated Resource Systems IN
26.	13-Oct-2016	FILED: NOTICE OF SERVING A.R.S. Â§ 12-1841 NOTICE TO ATTORNEY GENERAL, HOUSE SPEAKER, AND SENATE PRESIDENT; Certificate of Service; Exhibit A (Cross-Appellant)
27.	14-Oct-2016	FILED: Corrected Motion for Procedural Order of Defendant/Appellant Tourism and Sports Authority to Bifurcate Issues and to Establish Briefing Schedule; Certificate of Service to Corrected Motion for Procedural Order of Defendant/Appellant Tourism and Sports Authority to Bifurcate Issues and to Establish Briefing Schedule (Appellant)
28.	17-Oct-2016	ORDERED: Vacating 11/2/16 due date for opening briefs. Order ruling on pending motion (mo re: Bifurcate Issues) will set a due date for filing opening briefs. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
29.	18-Oct-2016	FILED: Arizona Department of Revenue's Motion to Dismiss Cross-Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
30.	18-Oct-2016	FILED: Arizona Department of Revenue's Motion to Bifurcate; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
31.	18-Oct-2016	FILED: Response to Corrected Motion for Procedural Order to Bifurcate Issues and to Establish Briefing Schedule; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
32.	1-Nov-2016	FILED: Stipulated Motion to Alter/Consolidate Procedural Motion Response and Reply Times; Certificate of Service (Appellee)

Information presented in this document may not reflect all case activity and is subject to change without notice.

1 CA-TX 16-0007 SABAN, et al. v. ADOR, et al.

43 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

33.	2-Nov-2016	ORDERED: Stipulated Motion to Alter/Consolidate Procedural Motion Response and Reply Times (Appellee) = GRANTED. FURTHER ORDERED: Extending time for Saban Rent-a-Car LLC to file a response to Tourism & Sports Authority's Corrected Motion for Procedural Order to Bifurcate Issues (See Order) to/including 11/7/16. FURTHER ORDERED: Tourism and Sports Authority may file a reply to Saban Rent-a-Car LLC's response and to Arizona Department of Revenue's response to Corrected Motion on/before 11/21/16 Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
34.	7-Nov-2016	FILED: Tourism and Sports Authority's Response to Motion to Dismiss Cross-Appeal; Certificate of Service to Tourism and Sports Authority's Response to Motion to Dismiss Cross-Appeal (Appellant)
35.	7-Nov-2016	FILED: Response to DOR's Motion to Bifurcate; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
36.	7-Nov-2016	FILED: Consolidated Response to (1) Arizona Department of Revenue's Motion to Bifurcate, and (2) Corrected Motion for Procedural Order of Defendant/Appellant Tourism and Sports Authority to Bifurcate Issues and to Establish Briefing Schedule; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
37.	7-Nov-2016	FILED: Response to Arizona Department of Revenue's Motion to Dismiss Cross-Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
38.	21-Nov-2016	FILED: Defendant/Appellant Tourism and Sports Authority's Reply in Support of Motion to Bifurcate and to Establish Briefing Schedule; Certificate of Service (Reply ISO Bifurcation) (Appellant)
39.	21-Nov-2016	FILED: Reply in Support of Motion to Bifurcate; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
40.	21-Nov-2016	FILED: Reply in Support of Motion to Dismiss Cross-Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
41.	30-Nov-2016	ORDERED: Arizona Department of Revenue's Motion to Dismiss Cross-Appeal (Appellant) = DENIED. FURTHER ORDERED: Corrected Motion for Procedural Order to Bifurcate Issues and to Establish Briefing Schedule (Appellant Tourism) and Arizona Department of Revenue's Motion to Bifurcate (Appellant) = DENIED. FURTHER ORDERED: Opening briefs shall be due on 1/17/17. Hon Margaret H Downie - Author
42.	22-Dec-2016	FILED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order re Extension of Time to File Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
43.	27-Dec-2016	ORDERED: Unopposed Motion for Procedural Order re Extension of Time to File Opening Brief (Appellant) = GRANTED and extending time for filing all opening briefs to/including 2-16-2017. Barbara Vidal Vaught ProTem Judge - Author

Information presented in this document may not reflect all case activity and is subject to change without notice.